

**BROOKLYN COMMUNITY BOARD 6
TRANSPORTATION/PUBLIC SAFETY COMMITTEE
January 18, 2018**

Attendance:

J. Armer	P	K. Gurl	A	M. Murphy	E
P. Blake	P	J. Hessney	P	R. Rigolli	P
K. Broughton	P	J. Krause-Vilmar	P	E. Santogade	P
J. Brown	P	S. Lee	A	M. Silverman	P
B. Chancey	P	R. Lynn	P	R. Sloane	P
E. Cho	A	E. McClure	P	J. Smith	P
D. Gordon	P	T. Miskel	P	M. Tannen	A

P = present, E = excused, A = absent

Guests:

L. MacNeil – Rep. for NYC Department of Transportation

J. Ellis – Rep. for North Flatbush BID

K. Lyon – Rep. for North Flatbush BID

R. Scibetti

P. Bonaventura

J. Grifo

D. Herman

J. Cella

M. Cella

A. Renda

G. Kelly

K. Kelly

R. Cahill

Y. Caraballo

N. Gomez

M. Racioppo

L. Torres

H. Chan

B. Moro

*****MINUTES*****

The meeting was called to order at 6:35pm by the co-chair Eric McClure.

Presentation and consideration of a proposal by the North Flatbush BID to install planters along Flatbush Avenue between Pacific Street and 8th Avenue.

Presentation from North Flatbush BID by executive director of BID.

BID seeks to install approximately 70 planters along Flatbush Avenue. Approximately 40 will be within CB6 boundaries.

Sidewalks on Flatbush are 15 – 20 feet wide, many with subway grates, limiting opportunities to add new street trees. Planters are the only opportunity to increase greenery outside of triangle parks.

Coincides with \$60M DDC infrastructure project to improve pedestrian space and expand 12 curbs.

BID has worked with DOT and Parks and Recreation to identify preferred planter styles and plantings. BID will add perennials and annuals. 2 – 3 plantings per year depending on conditions. Has collaborated with DOT on siting locations, taking into consideration crosswalks, subway entrances. Has received support from businesses/residents on Flatbush Ave.

BID will work with 3rd party vendor to maintain planters, water and weed, and keep area clean.

Timeline: Present to CB6 and CB8 in Jan/Feb. Submit application to Public Design Commission in March. Install Phase 1 (approximately 35 planters) in March 2018. Phase 2 in April 2019 to allow DDC project to finish.

Public questions:

Why were neighbors not notified? Why is this meeting held here and not near Flatbush?

Answer from Eric McClure: Public sidewalks do not require neighborhood-wide notification. Verified by DOT.

Is BID working with Brooklyn Botanic Garden?

BID is working with Horticultural Society of NY on appropriate planters. Will work with vendors to use environmentally friendly materials, fertilizers, etc.

Jerry Armer: Is BID planning to increase assessment or take money from somewhere else, if so where?

BID: Budget is \$150K/year total. For pilot program, council members are supporting with discretionary spending. More sponsorships will come from events.

Joanne Brown: Will planters narrow sidewalks?

BID: Will be placed along curb. BID has worked with DOT to identify proper siting. Also making room for coming Union Market and is not putting planters there to facilitate deliveries.

Ian Dutton: Thanks BID for current planters on pedestrian triangles. Is pedestrian safety part of the plan? Defense from out-of-control drivers?

BID: Not framing this as bollards, but are creating demarcated space in pedestrian triangles and bump-outs. Will not be there once pedestrian spaces are built out by DDC.

Pauline Blake: Triangle parks are the last piece of project?

BID: Yes.

Pauline Blake: Is Barclays Center excluded?

BID: Yes. Nothing around arena, nothing in front of Modell's. Nothing in the triangles, since they already have greenery. Barclays Center also already has bollards, which would be too cluttered with planters.

Bahij Chancey: Urges BID to consider native plantings. Will BID do periodic check to make sure nothing is moved?

BID: Yes. Will do periodic maintenance, which will include checks. Site locations also aren't 100% set in stone and can change based on business feedback. Can be moved as needed.

Q: Will planters be on subway grates?

BID: No. Regulations do not allow this. DOT has 8-foot clearance guidelines and Flatbush has wide sidewalks. Even with these there, Flatbush will have excess clearance.

Q: Has BID considered safety from terrorism?

BID: BID isn't trying to frame this as a safety measure, but that is a collateral benefit.

BID estimates \$15K/year for plantings watering, budget can sustain that.

Joanna Oltman Smith: Are there seasonal requirements for vendors?

BID: Three-season plantings are planned for now. Will add mulch for winter.

MOTION PUT FORTH BY Jerry Armer:

We recommend to the Public Design Commission, DOT and other agencies our wholehearted support of this proposal. The sooner we get to Phase 2 the better. The motion was seconded by Bahij Chancey.

MOTION PASSED: Unanimously.

ITEM 2: Presentation and consideration of NYC Department of Transportation's proposed locations for implementation of the NYC Carshare Pilot Program.

No motion required tonight as this was a mandated City Council program. No vote on the project.

Presented by: Laura MacNeil, DOT. Leroy Branch, DOT.

Branch: DOT is soliciting feedback on locations related to safety, business. "Just because you don't want it there is not a good reason."

Eric McClure: DOT came in June to present to committee. Online portal was open to take feedback. CB6 sent out info in July.

Branch: Brad Lander's portal was open.

MacNeil: Carshare presentation.

Full presentation on DOT website:

http://nycdotcarshare.info/sites/default/files/2018-01/BK6_carshare_01.18.18_website.pdf

- Challenge of continued growth. Congestion. Sustainable means of transportation.
- DOT sees carshare as one of those ways of increasing sustainable modes of transportation.
- Carshare is a service providing access to automobiles for short periods of time. Includes insurance, gas, maintenance, and place to park.
- Currently, most carshare is limited to where there is off-street parking/garages. Leaves voids in map.
- Car2Go offers on-street placement, can be dropped off anywhere in home area.
- NYC is number one market for carshare in country.
- DOT consulted other cities for best practices.
- Members of round-trip carshare companies – up to 32% report giving up a car. One-way programs: 5%. Others put off purchase of personal vehicle.
- Reduction in Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT).
- Offers low-cost, low-hassle way for non-car owners to access cars when needed.
- City Council Local Law 47 and Local Law 50 passed to establish pilot program. Signed into law in March by Mayor de Blasio.
- DOT is proposing two-year pilot program to use permits for carshare parking spaces. Benefits: fast implementation, flexibility. Locations can be moved. Companies that don't comply with program can have permit revoked.

- 14 zones citywide based on mobility benefits and reduced parking demands.
- Companies required to provide ADA accommodations, incentives for discounted rates for low-income NYers.
- Two parking spaces per site. Designated by sign with curbside regulations and pedestrian-level signs explaining the program. DOT provides spaces, but not the carshare service. That is provided by the carshare companies themselves.
- Carshare companies are responsible for maintenance. Alternate-side parking (ASP) regulations do not apply to carshare spaces. Companies must clean at same frequency of adjacent ASP regulations.
- Companies may relocate cars that do not have permit privileges for the spot. Same process as film shoots. No expense to car owner. NYPD can ticket and tow.
- Park Slope: DOT will site 15 locations (30 spaces) for pilot.
- Red Hook: 5 locations (10 spaces)
- Carroll Gardens: 15 locations (30 spaces)
- Boerum Hill: 10 locations (20 spaces)
- Implementation: Spring 2018.
- Info: nycdotcarshare.info

Discussion:

Elena Santogade: Excited about program, has spoken with neighborhood association, lots of interest among people who have smaller uses for cars.

Q: We double park our cars for ASP, but if that car doesn't move for ASP, cleaner cannot get around.
DOT: We will evaluate during pilot. Corner locations will help allow sanitation to move around cars.

Q: Will DOT be responsible for damage to sidewalk for installation of new signs.
DOT: Hoping to use existing pole locations to consolidate signage.

Assembly Member Robert Carroll: concern with giving public property to private corporations.
DOT: This will reduce parking demand.

Q: Do you own a car? How did you reach out to those without computers? Is there a time limit to how long someone can use a car? Our block has lost parking spaces to driveways.

Ty Beatty, CB6: Summer outreach, sent to full email list in district. Includes 13,000 people, block associations, electeds. Portal was hosted on website from summer through Thanksgiving. Did more than typical outreach.

Q: Where do you live?
CB6: Not something you have to answer.

Comment: Parking has become a challenge. They park everywhere. Put the spots on Court and Smith in metered spots. 2nd Place spots seem too close together.
DOT: We will look at 2nd Place.

Q: We are happy to give up spots to those who want it. We have such terror about parking and people being rude. Clinton and Hicks are filled with traffic. We don't need this. Car2Go is at least fair.

Q: What are measurables that will be put in place so that DOT and public knows it's working? Do other cities have those specific? Do those other cities have robust transportation systems?

DOT: We will evaluate by working with UC Berkeley Transportation Research unit to do surveys of carshare members before and during program. We're mandating data-sharing. Will look at parking analysis. We believe bringing the pilot will be a valuable service and benefit. Legislation mandates annual data reports.

Q: Is there a vote at end of two-year pilot?

DOT: Yes, we will definitely be coming back.

Q: Cheever Place has 8 driveways and 2 hydrants. Would you consider Hicks Street or other locations?

Q: Two spots of concern: Nelson/Clinton is not ideal as spots are already lost to private garages and lots. 4th Place has many driveways. Roughly 10. Will DOT consider relocating those spots?

DOT: Will consider these locations. Those spots, however, were suggested through online portal but we will take into consideration.

Q: What measurement is used for spots?

DOT: DOT standard of 20 feet per space, 40 total. Car2Go is transitioning out of SmartCars and to larger vehicles. Will be using bigger Mercedes Benz models.

Q: Will Enterprise get to use spots? It already has spots in lots. How is this determined?

DOT: Criteria: locations are shared with carshare companies. Companies must meet 20% equity – low-income areas that don't have existing carshare. Companies can give preferences of locations. No guarantee that Enterprise would get the spot near their existing garage. May have higher preference for it, however.

Q: Why do companies get particular spots? Why not leave it open to all?

DOT: Users want to know what you're getting, who is responsible for providing the service. Provides name recognition, reliability, and accountability.

Eric McClure: Adds identifiable responsibility for maintenance.

Rita Lynn: In Barclays Center impact zone people park anywhere. Who is responsible? How quickly will cars be moved? How will they be ticketed? How will people get around double-parked cars during ASP?

DOT: We will work with NYPD and carshare companies. People can call companies and ask them to relocate the car or call NYPD. DOT will be watching how these options work. We think sizeable percent of people who have cars for occasional use will reconsider transportation options.

Q: I'm looking forward to getting rid of my car and giving a spot to someone who needs it more than me. Can DOT come to CB6 once you have data? Do companies pay for permits?

DOT: Yes. OMB will collect a nominal fee from the carshare companies. Just for the issuance of the permit and evaluation of permit application. DOT can assess with data how to better address curbside demand. DOT will come back to CB6.

Jerry Armer: Concern re: signage. You're establishing territories for these companies plus free advertising. If we're providing spots, it shouldn't matter what company.

DOT: No one company will have zone.

J. Armer: But even individual spots will be given over to one company.

DOT: We considered this. In other cities opening spots to every company creates confusion, lack of accountability. Comes from best practice of other companies.

J. Armer: Concern that this is fiat designating public space to private company.

DOT: In Park Slope we could have six companies competing for spots.

J. Armer: It should be carshare spots period.

Q: My concern is density. If cars are not available and with six companies and 12 – 15 locations, there's no density. We want to see program succeed but it needs to be substantial.

DOT: That is one of the things we hope to learn through this pilot. If we'll be a victim of our own success. We are using this two-year pilot to assess and learn, and perhaps after a year we will see what's working and what's not, we will be coming back to give you more information.

Pauline Blake: When you install these carshare services they will be limited to X number of cars per location?

DOT: 40 feet. If carshare company uses SmartCars and can fit three cars in space, they can do that. But most will use two. We will limit the space.

Q: Degraw/Cheever. Where Cheever runs into DeGraw, there is no parking because of Key Food trucks, plus seven houses with recessed carports designed for two cars each. Plus there are three hydrants. This specific site may need to be revisited.

DOT: Thank you. We will note that.

Q: I would like to see that we're taking trips that would otherwise be taken by private car be switched to carshare and not trips that would otherwise be taken on transit or bike. At program level we should not chase transit riders as customers. Also, cleanliness of spots and parking enforcement – can 311 system and app accept carshare space complaints?

DOT: We are working with 311. Plan to put in place means of reporting poorly maintained spaces. Blocked space notification. DOT will look at 311 data. We are also interested in seeing if this increases VMT in city or provides decreases.

Joanna Oltman Smith: This will reduce the number of car trips in NYC. Will make cost of car use very apparent to users. Wondering about exclusivity of spaces. Any discussion with EDC of making interim spots accessible to all companies? Possible benefits to making it more generic. Could maintenance responsibilities be assigned by size of fleet?

Q: Concern re: DeGraw Street, Cheever Place. Another issue is the 76th Precinct on Union between Henry and Hicks. Concern with three [Citi] bike locations in two-block radius. Carroll between Henry and Hicks has heavy parking demand. Why don't you have all these spots on Hicks when there are so many of them?

DOT: Hicks is right by the BQE, so you only have one side of the street next to where people live. The highway takes away half the people who might find that location convenient. Did not meet the requirement to be an accessible location.

Q: What about homeowners who do renovations and need a dumpster.

DOT: Contractors, utilities must work with DOT permitting office. DOT can make alternate arrangement with carshare companies to suspend or move location. We also have emergency contingency plans.

Q: Do signs have contact info? Phone number for company?

DOT: Yes. On pedestrian-level signage they will have information, how to sign up, 800 numbers, etc.

Approval of Minutes from December 21, 2017 Committee meeting.

Minutes approved unanimously.

Meeting adjourned at 9 p.m.

Minutes recorded by Doug Gordon, submitted by Eric McClure.